



Training Materials Set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”

(Kyrgyz, Russian languages)

5 practical manuals based on experience of rural municipalities of the Kyrgyz Republic

ANNOTATION AND STRUCTURE

- Integration of local community’s priorities in decision-making on issues of local importance (ISBN 978-9967-11-502-6)
- Planning of joint actions by the local community and local self-government bodies on issues of local importance (ISBN 978-9967-11-534-7)
- Public activities (meetings, gatherings and public hearings) as a form of citizen participation in local self-government (ISBN 978-9967-11-509-5)
- Planned monitoring and regular evaluation of local self-governments’ performance by the local communities (ISBN 978-9967-11-507-1)
- Municipal index of budget transparency as a tool for citizen participation in the budget process of local self-government (ISBN 978-9967-11-535-4)

Bishkek – 2016

Description of Training Materials Set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”

Under general editorship of N.DOBRETSOVA, chairperson of the Board, DPI

Training materials set (TMS) on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic” is intended for bodies of local self-government and active representatives of local communities seeking to exercise their constitutional right to take advantage of and responsibility to address issues of local importance.

TMS is based on a model of citizen participation in local self-government of the Kyrgyz Republic (CPLSG Model). CPLSG Model is a complex of activities envisaged by the KR legislation, which, on the one hand, allows the bodies of local self-government to be accountable to local communities on issues of local importance, to involve citizens in public decision making, including in respect of distribution of local resources, on the other hand - allows citizens to exercise their constitutional right to participate in local self-government. Model is based on the letter and spirit of the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic, as well as the principles laid down in the law on local self-government:

- transparency and accountability of local self-government to local community for execution of functions for benefit of local community;
- rule of law and social justice;
- citizens’ will expression through local self-government system, as well as through citizens’ assemblies, meetings and kurultais;
- protection of the rights and lawful interests of local communities;
- openness and consideration of public opinion.

CPLSG Model assumes active and equal partnership between the two parties - local self-government bodies and local community. The main objective of this partnership is improvement of living conditions in a municipality. At the same time by the municipality one shall understand a trinity¹ of territory of an administrative-territorial unit; people living in the given territory; as well as the governing body addressing issues related to livelihood in the territory for the benefit of its population. Obviously, the two parts of the trinity – population and governing body – are the subjects, i.e. those who may affect a situation or object, while the territory (including material and non-material living conditions) is a targeted object. Model is based on this trinity and embodies a combination of actions undertaken by the public and governing authorities in order to best meet the needs and expectations of the population with regard to material and non-material surroundings in the municipality.

Despite a joint, bilateral and inclusive model, its implementation in practice is impossible without political will, a conscious decision of local self-governments. Namely LSG bodies according to the law have sufficient authority to establish conditions and environment needed to exercise citizens’ rights to participate in decision-making. Therefore, a formal initiative to introduce the model must come from local self-governments, although the introduction of the idea as such often starts with the active members of the community or civil society organizations.

CPLSG Model has emerged in result of multiple efforts of a variety of projects and programs implemented in different years in hundreds of municipalities across Kyrgyzstan. Each element of the Model is individually well known for the huge number of representatives from local communities, local self-governments, majority of civil society organizations’ representatives,

¹ Trinity – unity (inseparable combination) of three entities, events, features. Modern Dictionary of Russian language of Efremova. Available at the following link:
<http://dic.academic.ru/dic.nsf/efremova/255807/Триединство>

therefore an authorship of the Model could be considered as public conditionally, however, it was described in the implementation process of the project on “Voice of Citizens and Accountability of Local Self-Government: Budget Process”².

The Model activities are associated with formalized processes in the local self-government system such as budgetary process, election cycle, medium-term program planning. At the same time, the Model reflects informal characteristics of being of local communities, particularly mentality. On the one hand, the Model takes into account communities’ traditions and behavioral patterns such as habit of discussing important information at village meetings. On the other - it involves the use of modern methods of participation, such as monitoring and evaluation of services. A combination of traditions, modern trends in governance and requirements of the KR legislation makes the citizen participation model in local self-government live and flexible, allowing to really improve material and non-material living conditions of the communities, generating and multiplying the resources required.

In 2016, the set consists of five practical and methodic manuals based on the experience of the rural municipalities of the Kyrgyz Republic and it is dedicated to the following issues: 1) integration of the local community priorities in decision-making on issues of local importance (ISBN 978-9967-11-502-6); 2) planning of joint actions by the local community and local self-government bodies on issues of local importance (ISBN 978-9967-11-534-7); 3) public activities (meetings, gatherings and public hearings) as a form of citizen participation in local self-government (ISBN 978-9967-11-509-5); 4) planned monitoring and regular evaluation of local self-governments’ performance by the local communities (ISBN 978-9967-11-507-1); 5) municipal index of budget transparency as a tool for citizen participation in the budget process of local self-government (ISBN 978-9967-11-535-4). The set can be supplemented by new training practical materials in the coming years.

The practical value of TMS is that all the manuals are supported by templates and forms of the documents, provided in printed and electronic forms. Electronic appendices also contain the full texts of the main legal regulations, governing the topics of the manuals.

TMS passed through gender analysis, performed by the gender expert Janyl ABDYLDABEK kyzy per request of the Development Policy Institute.



Publication of TMS was made possible thanks to the financial support of the project on “Voice of Citizens and Accountability of Local Self-Government: Budget Process” funded by the Government of Switzerland in collaboration with the British Department for International Development, and executed by the Development Policy Institute.

Opinions, findings, conclusions and recommendations expressed in this publication are the position and experience of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Government of Switzerland, the British Department for International Development.

² Financial support from the Government of Switzerland and British Department for International Development. Implemented by Development Policy Institute.



PART ONE

Integration of the local community priorities in LSG decision-making on issues of local importance

Practical manual / Training materials set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”. / DOBRETSOVA N., BALAKUNOVA A., MUSAEVA A., GRADWAL S. – B.: Development Policy Institute, 2015. – 50 p.

УДК 351/354

ББК 67.99(2)1

У 91

У 1203020200-15

ISBN 978-9967-11-502-6

DESCRIPTION

This manual examines principles for consideration of the local community priorities in decision-making by the bodies of local self-government as an integral part and necessary pre-condition for the citizen participation in local self-government. The manual gives an idea about the essence of the citizen participation in local self-government based on the experience of Kyrgyzstan and international scope, as well as explains to municipal leaders about the

benefits arising from engagement of the citizens in the issues of local importance. The manual is practical in nature and allows the bodies of local self-government to organize their own work to explore opinions and integrate the citizen priorities into the policies. The practical manual is intended primarily for the representative and executive bodies of local self-government, representatives of local communities, civil society organizations, international donor assistance projects, researchers and teachers. Despite the fact that the manual is based on the experience of rural municipalities, it can be successfully applied to small towns of the Kyrgyz Republic.

STRUCTURE

List of acronyms

Important definitions

Why do citizens participate in local self-government?

Citizen participation in local self-government: principle and international law

Local self-government – the most democratic and closest to population part of the governance system

Evolution from manipulation to cooperation

Model of citizen participation in local self-government in the Kyrgyz Republic

Integration of citizen priorities in LSG decision-making

Priority Rural Assessment (PRA) – the first step to true partnership between citizens and bodies of local self-governance

Why is it beneficial for LSG to examine the public opinion?

Meaning of priority under the resource deficiency

What is PRA?

What cases does LSG use PRA in?

Why can one trust the PRA results?

Types of PRA activities

Stages in organization and conduct of complex PRA activities

Organizational stage of PRA

Political decision on conducting PRA, establishment of working group, PRA planning, common mistakes made by LSGs in planning complex PRA activities, documents for the organizational stage of PRA

Informational and analytical stage of PRA. Description of methods

Mapping, Venn diagram, "Pie", Gallery of problems, cause-and-effect links, and common mistakes made by LSGs in conducting PRA-sessions and PRA focus-groups documents for the informational and analytical stage of PRA

Consideration of PRA results in decision-making process

Development of Joint Action Plan

Implementation of Joint Action Plan

Practice of integration of the local community priorities

Lipenka aiyl aimak: long journey to big water

Appendices

- | | |
|--------------|--|
| Appendix 1. | Template of decree by head of aiyl okmotu on establishment of the working group to conduct PRA |
| Appendix 2. | Decree of the head of aiyl okmotu on approval of Action Plan and timeframe for the working group to conduct complex PRA activities |
| Appendix 3. | Exemplary activities plan for the working group to conduct complex PRA activities |
| Appendix 4. | Exemplary schedule for complex PRA activities |
| Appendix 5. | Drafts of agenda for PRA-session and PRA focus-group |
| Appendix 6. | Template of PRA-session list of participants |
| Appendix 7. | Template of report on PRA-session conducted |
| Appendix 8. | Template of report on PRA focus-groups |
| Appendix 9. | Template of report on planning meeting |
| Appendix 10. | Example of PRA activities minutes |
| Appendix 11. | List of electronic documents saved on disc attached to this publication |



PART TWO

Planning of joint actions by the local community and local self-government bodies on issues of local importance

Practical manual / Training materials set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic” under general editorship of N.Dobretsova. Part Two. / T. OSMONKULOV, R. SURANCHIEVA, S. GRADWAL, OROZBAEV B. – B.: Development Policy Institute, 2015. – 72 p.

УДК 351/354

ББК 67.99(2)1

П 37

П 1203020200-15

ISBN 978-9967-11-534-7

DESCRIPTION

This manual examines the Joint Actions Plan by the community and local self-governments to address the issues of local importance as a transitional tool effectively used by the municipalities in the Kyrgyz Republic in the process of local development

planning. The manual describes the process of developing Joint Action Plan in details based on the results of Priority Rural Assessment of the community needs, so that Joint Action Plan becomes a genuine mechanism for integration of the community priorities into the development and operation of local self-government. The manual describes the role of parties in the development and implementation of the plan, provides examples of the required outputs and documents; contains a collection of normative legal acts in electronic form. The manual is practical and allows the bodies of local self-government to organize their work on the development and implementation of the Joint Action Plan by the community and local self-government to address the issues of local importance. The practical manual is intended primarily for the representative and executive bodies of local self-government, representatives of local communities, civil society organizations, international donor assistance projects, researchers and teachers. Despite the fact that the manual is based on the experience of rural municipalities, it can be successfully applied to small towns of the Kyrgyz Republic.

STRUCTURE

List of acronyms

Important definitions

Chapter 1. Fundamentals for citizen participation in local self-government

- 1.1. Local self-government – the most democratic and closest to population part of the governance system
- 1.2. Evolution from manipulation to cooperation
- 1.3. Model of citizen participation in local self-government in the Kyrgyz Republic
- 1.4. Integration of citizen priorities in LSG decision-making
- 1.5. Initiative groups and their role in planning process

Chapter 2. Principles and stages of Joint Action Plan development

- 2.1. Definition and role of Joint Action Plan
- 2.2. Principles of planning the local community development
- 2.3. Stages of the Joint Action Plan development by the local community and LSGs

Chapter 3. JAP development process

- 3.1. Organization of process for JAP development
- 3.2. JAP development – provisioning the plan with content and resources
- 3.3. Concurrence and disclosure of Joint Action Plan

Chapter 4. Implementation of Joint Action Plan

- 4.1. Roles of parties in JAP implementation
- 4.2. Monitoring and evaluation of results
- 4.3. Reporting
- 4.4. Common mistakes made in JAP implementation process
- 4.5. Documents for JAP implementation

Chapter 5. Practice of development and implementation of Joint Action Plan by local communities and LSGs to address issues of local importance

Thanks to Joint Action Plan, it became lighter in Ak-Chii AA

In Kok-Irim AA many people were engaged in the process with help of brochure on JAP

In Beshik-Zhon, JAP allowed addressing lack of kindergartens – children are busy and mothers are happy!

Lenin AA won the garbage

Appendices

- Appendix 1. Example of plan for working group on JAP development
- Appendix 2. Example of description of the problem as part of report on the planning meeting within PRA
- Appendix 3. Format of Joint Action Plan
- Appendix 4. Steps to prepare and adopt decree of local kenesh (council)
- Appendix 5. Steps to prepare and conduct the local council session
- Appendix 6. Rules for conducting the local council session
- Appendix 7. Order of enforcement of decrees adopted by the local council
- Appendix 8. Agenda for the open session held by ayil kenesh of XXVI calling in Kara-Zhal ayil aimak
- Appendix 9. Example of minutes of the local council session
- Appendix 10. Example of conclusion made by permanent commission of the local council
- Appendix 11. Example of act for assigning tasks to employee
- Appendix 12. Template of report on employee's work
- Appendix 13. Report on Joint Action Plan implementation (on example of Ak-Chii AA)
- Appendix 14. Example of real Joint Action Plan by the community and LSG of Kurmanbek ayil aimak (fragments)
- Appendix 15. Graphics of development and implementation of Joint Action Plan
- Appendix 16. List of electronic documents saved on disc attached to this publication



PART THREE

Public activities (meetings, gatherings and public hearings) as a form of citizen participation in local self-government

Practical manual / Training materials set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”. Part Three. / DOBRETSOVA N., BALAKUNOVA A., MUSAEVA A., GRADWAL S. – B.: Development Policy Institute, 2015. – 80 p.

УДК 351/354

ББК 67.99(2)1

К 63

К 1203020200-15

ISBN 978-9967-11-509-5

DESCRIPTION

This manual covers basic forms of the citizen participation in local self-government - gatherings of citizens and public hearings. A need for this manual was justified by lack of descriptions of the procedures and regulations for these activities in the legislation. At the same time, legitimacy and recognition of the

meetings' and gatherings' results on the end of government - central and local self-government - largely depend on how the procedures are carried out, how the results are presented, what the representation of citizens or level of their participation in the gatherings is. Carelessly prepared, poorly conducted and left without feedback public events discredit the local self-government, destroy trust between LSGs and population, and reduce efficiency of cooperation of citizens and the authorities. The manual is practical and allows local self-governments to improve the quality and organization of public activities for their communities. The practical manual is intended primarily for the representative and executive bodies of local self-government, representatives of local communities, civil society organizations, international donor assistance projects, researchers and teachers. Despite the fact that the manual is based on the experience of rural municipalities, it can be successfully applied to small towns of the Kyrgyz Republic.

STRUCTURE

List of acronyms

Important definitions

Chapter 1. Fundamentals for citizen participation in local self-government

Principle and international law

Local self-government – the most democratic and closest to population part of the governance system

Evolution from manipulation to cooperation

Model of citizen participation in local self-government in the Kyrgyz Republic

Integration of citizen priorities in LSG decision-making

Chapter 2. Public activities: gatherings and public hearings

Gatherings and meetings of citizens

Public hearings

What is the difference between gatherings and public hearings?

Chapter 3. Guideline for organization and conducting meetings (gatherings) and public hearings

Preparation
Informing about upcoming event
Conducting public events
Informational campaign “after”

Chapter 4. Specifics of conducting thematic public hearings

Public hearings on budget
Public hearings on municipal property
Public hearings on tariffs and local services
Kurultai on municipality development strategy

Chapter 5. Practice of conducting rural gatherings

Citizens’ gatherings
Public hearings

Appendices

- | | |
|--------------|---|
| Appendix 1. | Decree of the head of aiyl okmotu on establishment of working group on conducting gathering |
| Appendix 2. | Exemplary agenda of rural gatherings |
| Appendix 3. | Example of the rural gathering minutes |
| Appendix 4. | Example of minutes from public hearing on budget |
| Appendix 5. | Form of feedback – answers to the citizens’ questions and proposals raised during the public hearings on budget |
| Appendix 6. | Informational bulletin prepared by LSG body |
| Appendix 7. | Rules to conduct public activities: development, content and dissemination |
| Appendix 8. | Preparation of oral speech (orator tips) |
| Appendix 9. | Example of brief budget summary (BBS) |
| Appendix 10. | List of electronic documents saved on disc attached to this publication |



PART FOUR

Planned monitoring and regular evaluation of local self-governments' performance by the local communities

Practical manual / Training materials set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”. Part Four. / Ch. BIYALIEVA, M. OROZBAEV, S. MAIRAMBEKOV, N. DOBRETSOVA. – B.: Development Policy Institute, 2015. – 40 p.

УДК 351/354

ББК 67.99(2)1

П 37

ISBN 978-9967-11-507-1

DESCRIPTION

This manual examines joint monitoring and evaluation as a continuous, planned, regular, joint activities of citizens and local self-governments, as opposed to “project” approach, which considers the process of monitoring and evaluation as part of a specific project

life cycle. Without denying the importance of monitoring and evaluation within the project cycle, the authors propose to assign regularity to the joint monitoring and evaluation elevating them to the function level performed by the citizens in cooperation with local self-governments. The manual is based on the practical experience of the joint monitoring and evaluation groups in the municipalities of Jalal-Abad and Issyk-Kul regions, and offers a methodology for creation and organization of such groups in other municipalities. The manual describes the role of the citizens, executive and representative bodies of local self-government in the process of monitoring and evaluation; provides recommendations to transform the monitoring and evaluation results into new solutions by LSGs. The manual is intended for the bodies of local self-government, active members of local communities, civil society organizations, international donor assistance projects, researchers and teachers. Despite the fact that the manual is based on the experience of rural municipalities, it can be successfully applied to small towns of the Kyrgyz Republic.

STRUCTURE

About manual

List of acronyms

I. Legal bases and actors of monitoring and evaluation of local self-government

II. System of planned monitoring and regular evaluation of LSGs' performance

- 2.1. Role of aiyl okmotu in M&E process
- 2.2. Role of aiyl kenesh in M&E process
- 2.3. Risks of “bending” towards control and potential for conflict
- 2.4. How to convince the head of aiyl okmotu and aiyl kenesh of necessity to develop and support regular joint monitoring and evaluation?
- 2.5. Motivation of joint monitoring and evaluation group members

III. Organization of process for joint monitoring and evaluation in aiyl aimak

- 3.1. Formation of JM&E group
 - 3.1.1. Informational campaign for community and all stakeholders
 - 3.1.2. Selection of candidates, composition and leader of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
 - 3.1.3. Composition of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
 - 3.1.4. What will the joint monitoring and evaluation group monitor and evaluate?
 - 3.1.5. Monitoring and evaluation of the budget process as one of the key objectives of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
 - 3.1.6. Rights and responsibilities of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
- 3.2. Planning the work of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
 - 3.2.1. Work plan of the joint monitoring and evaluation group
 - 3.2.2. Defining indicators
 - 3.2.3. Data collection methods
 - 3.2.4. Regularity and schedule for data collection
- 3.3. Documenting JM&E process

Conclusion

Appendices

- Appendix 1. In Terek-Sai people can count every som
- Appendix 2. Whose grass is greener? Results of the service monitoring
- Appendix 3. JM&E group and Municipal Index of Budget Transparency in Bosteri aiyl aimak
- Appendix 4. Format of JM&E group report on monitoring of the Joint Action Plan implementation by the local community and LSGs in addressing priority issues
- Appendix 5. Format of JM&E group report on monitoring of the information boards' content
- Appendix 6. Format of JM&E group report on monitoring of grant project implementation
- Appendix 7. Typical indicators collected at the local self-government level
- Appendix 8. Example of joint monitoring and evaluation plan of "Happy Childhood" Project (Creating conditions of comprehensive operation of the kindergarten for two villages) in Oktyabr aiyl aimak of Ak-Suu rayon in Issyk-Kul oblast
- Appendix 9. Example of act on results of joint monitoring and evaluation group work
- Appendix 10. List of electronic documents saved on disc attached to this publication



PART FIVE

Municipal index of budget transparency as a tool for citizen participation in the budget process of local self-government

Practical manual / Training materials set on “Citizen Participation in Local Self-Government of the Kyrgyz Republic”. Part Five / KOZHOSHEV A., TYULYUNDIEVA N. – B.: Development Policy Institute, 2015. – 64 p.

Reviewer – RAKHANOV N., head of Department of planning and monitoring of local budgets, Ministry of Finance of the Kyrgyz Republic.

УДК 351/354

ББК 67.99(2)1

К 58

К 1203020200-16

ISBN 978-9967-11-535-4

DESCRIPTION

Methods for evaluating the Municipal Index of Budget Transparency is based on international standards of fiscal transparency. The index is calculated as a comprehensive budget transparency index in three interrelated areas: composition, completeness and clarity of the budget documents; availability of budget information to the public (ways of disseminating information to citizens and the effectiveness of the activity) and participation of citizens in the budget process. Municipal index of budget transparency is a tool for assessing the activities of the executive bodies of local self-government on the one hand, and the involvement of citizens in the monitoring and evaluation processes - on the other. The index can be used by: the government and local self-governments to improve transparency in decentralization of the budget system and increase public confidence; international financial institutions for development of financial transparency and accountability; civil society institutions and local communities for public oversight and strengthening citizen participation; media to educate and inform the citizens, teaching them technologies of participation in governance. Application of the Municipal Index of Budget Transparency does not require any expenses on the part of state and local self-governments; moreover, the index calculation does not require special efforts and coordination with the government.

STRUCTURE

List of acronyms

Important definitions and terms in manual

Why do citizens need to participate in budget process of local self-government?

Citizen participation in local self-government: principle and international law

Local self-government – the most democratic and closest to population part of the governance system

Citizen rights to participate in budget process of local self-government

Why do local self-government and society need transparency and accountability of local budgets?

Municipal Index of Budget Transparency (MIBT)

Who can apply MIBT?

Who uses results of MIBT?

Step-by-step guide for applying MIBT

Methodic to calculate MIBT

Methods of observation and document exploration

MIBT formula

Specifics of evaluation criteria

“Difficult” criteria of evaluation

Practical application of MIBT in the Kyrgyz Republic

Appendices

- Appendix 1. MIBT indicators. Section 1. Composition and clarity of information provided
- Appendix 2. MIBT indicators. Section 2. Availability of budget information for population
- Appendix 3. MIBT indicators. Section 3. Citizen participation in budget process
- Appendix 4. Calendar for evaluation of budget documents
- Appendix 5. How to get the highest score? Brief instruction
- Appendix 6. The Dar Es Salaam Declaration on Budget Transparency, Accountability and Participation in Budget Process
- Appendix 7. Process of creating and format of JM&E group and initiative groups
- Appendix 8. Dictionary of budget terms
- Appendix 9. Draft expenditure section of the local budget for 2015-2027 (recommended form)
- Appendix 10. Draft revenues section of the local budget for 2015-2027 (recommended form)
- Appendix 11. Draft/plan of local budget (section “Assets and Obligations”) for 2015-2027, thousand soms (recommended form)
- Appendix 12. Social and economic indicators for 2012-2015, (recommended form)
- Appendix 13. Explanatory notes to draft local budget (recommended form)
- Appendix 14. Local budget expenditures for 2015 (recommended form)
- Appendix 15. Local budget revenues for 2015 (recommended form)
- Appendix 16. Report on local budget expenditures in 2014 (recommended form)
- Appendix 17. Report on local budget revenues in 2014 (recommended form)
- Appendix 18. Brief budget description
- Appendix 19. Exemplary report on resources for development in 2014
- Appendix 20. Procurement plan (recommended form)
- Appendix 21. Example of budget infographics